

Temporary Space: A Reflection upon 'Good City Form'

Rahma Hamidah, Evawani Ellisa

Department of Architecture, Faculty of Engineering, University of Indonesia

Corresponding e-mail: rahma.hamidah@ui.ac.id

Article info: Received: 20-3-2023, Revised: 20-6-2023, Accepted: 22-6-2023

Abstract. Temporary space is part of public space, which could be powerful enough to give the city its character and uniqueness. This study aims to investigate how "sense" and activities of temporary space created at Jalan Menpor Palsigunung, Depok, potent to distinguish the street's character. Analyses were done based on Kevin Lynch's theory in his book the Good City Form (1981). This qualitative study was conducted using empirical data through observation of the physical form and activities along both sidewalks of the street. The study findings suggest that the incorporation of semi-permanent retailing features can significantly enhance placemaking. These features imbue places with meaning through vibrant and recurring physical forms, as well as engaging face-to-face trading activities that draw many people to actively participate.

Keywords: Temporary Space, Sense, City Form, Depok

1. Introduction

Sustainable living depends on the mutual interrelation between people and cities. UN-Habitat initiated New Urban Agenda (NUA) through SDGs (Sustainable Development Goals) to define the world we want; to ensure that no one is left behind. In effect, the urban paradigm needs to shift the development's dimension into integrating social, economic, and environmental aspects (UN, 2017). As the city accommodates a variety of activities, it becomes the battleground for citizens to find opportunities to support their livelihoods, such as finding jobs and activities that have the potential to produce goods and services. The activities in urban spaces provide a place for economic activities that generate the place's character and enhance the city's uniqueness since they promote human contact and social activities. The public space, which is safe, welcoming, and accommodating for all users, acts as an instrument for expressing the city's character (Gehl, 2010).

Public space serves as a centre for shared communal experiences (Tiwari, 2017), which people can access and use for public interests. The concept of 'cities for all' in the New Urban Agenda (UN, 2017) emphasizes the involvement of all pertinent actors as a vital step for sustainable urban development. The quality of a place results from the interaction between the city's spatial structure and society's value. The emergence of temporary spaces that improve urban livability is one of the phenomena in public spaces. It is a temporary traders' area with semi-permanent facilities for selling along the sidewalks. Temporary use of space emerged due to the socioeconomic and cultural circumstances of urban living as a form of opportunity which alters the concept of time and temporality (Madanipour, 2018) in a flexible form of public space (Madanipour, 2018; Allegri, 2017).

Allegri (2017) mentioned that temporary commercial space is spreading features alongside permanent commercial buildings in the form of food trucks, pop-up stores, and stalls. Many different products are offered in temporary spaces, including food, homemade products, and household appliances. However, temporary commercial space needs to be examined further, given that it reflects the spontaneous quality of urban space. It appears to be the urban complexity that initially is not expected to host commercial activities.

Jalan Menpor Palsigunung is a street in Depok, Indonesia, that becomes the melting point between commercial and residential areas. Traditional Market called "Pasar Pal" marks this strip, which provided daily commodities amid the proliferation of modern shopping facilities at Depok. It illustrates how the culture of traditional shopping still survived. Despite the existence of the traditional market, there are semi-permanent facilities on the sidewalk which are utilized for more than just pedestrian ways but also become a temporary space for commercial and small retail businesses. This street became the place where local communities interacted and conducted economic activities that generated heterogeneous interactions.

Jalan Menpor Palsigunung is the typical main street at the neighbourhood level in many developing urban areas in Indonesia. The street is in the Kelapa Dua area in Depok, Indonesia. Two arterial streets connect Jalan Menpor Palsigunung in Depok; Jalan Akses UI and Jalan Raya Bogor. Research in the context of Jalan Akses UI Kelapa Dua was conducted by Wasnadi and Ellisa (2019) focused on unanticipated and unaccommodated transformational processes that generated informal urban patterns. It emerges as a substitute for actions by the formal sector. On the other hand, Nishikawa et al. (2019), in their study of the accessibility of the area around the Kelapa Dua district, found that the existing streets were not in a desirable condition. However, the factors that contribute to the deterioration of accessibility cannot be considered isolated factors, as they are the result of a complex interplay of multiple causes that perpetuate the negative cycle.

Unlike the previous studies, this research focuses not on accessibility or transformability but on public space quality. There needs to be more appraising of the existence of semi-permanent facilities in temporary space at Jalan Menpor Palsigunung. The strip has abundant commercial activities that liven up its public space. This study examines whether the physical quality and activity of semi-permanent features aligned with the dimension of 'sense' according to Kevin Lynch's theory in his book The Good City Form (1981). This study was conducted to identify how the theory of Kevin Lynch is relevant when applied in the context of typical Indonesian streets utilized by people with strong local cultures. The initial assumption in this study is that semi-permanent facilities embody a 'sense' of the surrounding community. The sense emerged through the ambience created by activities taking part on both street's sidewalks that local visitors could access easily.

2. Methods

Jalan Menpor Palsigunung is adjacent to Jalan Akses UI Kelapa Dua, an important street holding the primary role as the generator development of Depok city. At a macro level, the street is the secondary street of the Kepala Dua district. The area connects the city of Depok with Bogor and Jakarta through two arterial streets, Jalan UI Access in the East, and Jalan Raya Bogor in the West (Figure 2.1). It is the melting point between commercial areas and residential areas.

At the end of Jalan Menpor Palsigunung, adjacent to Jalan Raya Bogor and Jalan Akses UI, there is a traditional market called Pasar Pal. The historical record mentioned that Pasar Pal was originally the location of "Pal Cimanggis", or the post to mark the location of Cimanggis at Jalan Raya Bogor as part of the postal highway (*De Grote Postweg*). In 1808-1811 Herman Willem Daendels the Governor General of the Dutch East Indies, built the road to smooth communication between regions along the island of Java and passed the recent Jalan Raya Bogor. In the post-colonial era, before the Jagorawi Toll Road, people heading to Bogor or Jakarta from Bogor used this road.



Figure 2.1. Research Context (Author, 2022)

Although the local government constructed the Pasar Pal into a two-story indoor market building, it is classified as the traditional Market where the buyers and sellers can trade directly to bargain. Despite the existence of the Market, there is an abundance of semi-permanent facilities in the pedestrian ways as a form of temporary space. Pasar Pal is like other traditional markets worldwide (Madanipour, 2018; Allegri, 2017). Jalan Menpor Palsigunung is the one-kilometer street that stretches from Pasar Pal. There is a shaded path inside the Pasar Pal where motorcyclists and pedestrians freely cross from Jalan Akses UI on the West and Jalan Raya Bogor on the West to reach Jalan Menpor Palsigunung.

This study employs a qualitative approach to comprehend the performance of sense in city form theory of Kevin Lynch which operates through temporary space for trading. The dimension of "sense" serves as a valuable aspect of city form that has been utilized effectively to investigate the dynamics of semi-permanent facilities with trading activities. According to Allegri (2017) it enhances the value of urban space and effectively depict the urban environment. The sense of a specific place can be assessed in various ways depending on the observer's objective. Sense involves perception, considered an active act which can be interpreted following the investigation of context and values. Sense influences perceptions of people towards their surroundings, which can be explored through various activities in the space to support how the place to the extent that they are perceived as vibrant.

The data is analyzed using the descriptive technique to explore how urban space can be perceived by occupying temporary space on sidewalks based on the sense dimension. Following Lynch (1981) the aspects of sense examined in this study are structure, identity, congruence, and transparency. Empirical data were analyzed through the visual dimension of urban context to categorize different factors which give meaning to urban space in the urban fabric (Abusaada & Elshater, 2021). The quality of a place in a city can be identified through the characteristics of the place and its people. Lynch's theory of good city form reviews city performance by articulating the relationship between city form and its purpose in the urban environment that emerges based on how people live in a particular environment. Identifying a good city form's performance requires focusing on non-physical and physical qualities. Intangible, non-physical elements of an urban environment play a crucial role in connecting with the physical aspects of a city and are instrumental in shaping its future development across diverse human contexts.

The Lynch's five (5) dimensions which characterize the performance of a good city form are vitality, sense, fit, access, and control. Each dimension has sub-dimensions that can be used to analyse varying degrees in an urban environment. Sub-dimensions can be used to describe the relationship between urban form and human value in specific contexts. Hence, good city form theory is carried out to review existing conditions and identify gaps in understanding the urban environment. The five dimensions are summarized in Table 3.1 below:

Dimension	Characteristics
Vitality	The extent to which the form of the environment supports vital functions, biological needs, and human abilities to survive.
Sense	The extent to which the environment can be clearly understood by its inhabitants.
Fit	The spatial capacity of an urban environment that matches the functional aspect based on the pattern of actions in which people are usually involved.
Access	The ability to reach other people, activities, resources, services, information, place, and other elements.
Control	The extent to which people who use and access an urban space can influence its boundaries.

Table 2.1. Characteristics of the Good City Form by Lynch (Author's Analysis, 2022)

Kevin Lynch in the Good City Form describes how a particular environment can be perceived and connected with other places through the involvement of the physical form of an environment and human perception. Sense characterizes the fit between environment, sensory and mental capabilities, and cultural constructs. Despite contextual differences, such as values in a specific environment, there are some constant aspects of sense, which are everyday experiences and cultural norms among people who use a particular place regularly. Sense can be assessed through the sub-dimensions of identity and structure, which illustrate the physical conditions of a place. Identity is the ability of a person to recognize a place as differentiated from others through the distinctive character of a place and experience sensing such as wind, touches, sounds, colours, and forms.

Data collection used to analyse the identity of a place is carried out by field observation. Following the theory of Lynch, the structure is the sense of how elements in a place fit together and how people can recognize the sense of orientation in terms of knowing how other places are related to a particular place. Structure-related elements include activity, landmarks, and paths. The discussion on this study describes structure firstly to depict the condition of semi-permanent facilities on Jalan Menpor Palsigunung and its connection to other physical elements.

According to Kevin Lynch, the sub-dimensions of sense that link the spatial structure of the environment to the non-spatial aspects are congruence and transparency. Congruence is the connection between the form of a place to its non-spatial structure, such as functions and features of the society. In this study, congruence is examined from the author's standpoint based on field observations, which is subsequently analysed by diagramming parts of a place to see how it matches the function, economy, society, or natural process of the place. Transparency is an element of sensibility that can be observed through functions, activities, and social processes in a particular environment. In this study, the author's senses as an observer are involved in analysing transparency.

Street is a morphological element of a city which differentiate what is public, thus accessible to all people as a place that forms social interactions (Oliveira, 2016). Therefore, the livability of the street is an indicator to prove the existence of a robust civil society (Oliveira, 2016). Furthermore, streets facilitate movement in urban life, making them an essential component in meeting people's needs to connect with others and places for self-actualization. Based on the principle of 'connecting places, connecting people (Tiwari, 2017), the street is a public space that acts as a centre of activity that brings interaction and bind togetherness in society. Fontana-Giusti (2007) and Froome-Lewis (2014) conducted their study by observing their

research area by walking to get a direct experience of urban space. The observation aims to break the routine of walking into a tool for criticizing urban space, revealing the potential of a place to be experienced rather than just a physical element of a city through interactions. It demonstrates that streets are places for interaction, both between people and with places.

Tiwari 2017) mentioned that urban growth can be managed by accommodating accessible urban spaces. They serve as a form of urban identity in terms of how people connect to the places they occupied. According to Tiwari connectivity can be improved by making connections between destinations more affordable and creating places for people to experience. Such attempts are made for better urban quality for the community, as well as actions towards a sustainable environment. Involving users in the process of placemaking to transform connections between destinations into high-quality places fosters a sense of ownership and community identity. Understanding the configuration of the area by focusing on the distinctive character of the place is possible through the interaction of physical settings, activities, and cultural values created by individuals and communities.

Urban character is a social and spatial phenomenon that emerges from social aspects and tends to be diverse and flexible (Dovey, 2016). The physical form of a city, as well as lifestyle and sociocultural values fostered by community activities, determine the character of a place. The findings of a study conducted by Abusaada and Elshater (2021) distinguish the terms space and place in the urban design literature and show that space emerges due to physical construction.

In contrast, the place is a non-physical construction formed through perceptions and meanings formed in urban space. In the urban context, urban space is a physical form represented by building blocks and other elements (Abusaada & Elshater, 2021). Therefore, connecting people and place through placemaking improves the physical quality of public space to support the continuity of values and culture reflected by the community.

Public space connects to an urban environment's social, economic, and cultural aspects. Chalana & Hou (2016) used the term urban informality as a phenomenon that depicts an alternative to urban conditions dominated by social, political, and cultural norms. Urban informality emphasizes another type of messiness that needs to follow regularity in urban planning and design. In Ho Chi Minh City, sidewalks were historically used for commercial and recreational purposes. However, the concept of informality has become a prominent topic of discussion in contemporary debates surrounding policies related to sidewalk clearance.

Urban informality is also represented through temporary space as a flexible spatial production in vacant spaces, creating opportunities for overlapping uses in public space (Madanipour, 2018). According to Allegri (2017), the emergence of temporary commercial spaces signifies a shift in the utilization of the commercial model within public spaces. It acts as an economic initiative, adding value and meaning to urban space by attracting people to participate in trading dynamics. Therefore, temporary space reflects the need to rethink how public space creates an opportunity for new demands of urban actors involved in commercial activities. Temporary space is manifested through semi-permanent facilities such as stalls in the form of kiosks or shops with semi-permanent structures, food trucks, and pop-up shops.

3. Discussion

This section presents a combination of field observation data, which provides firsthand insights, and secondary data sourced from the existing literature. The findings and discussions are grouped based on the sense sub-dimensions: structure, identity, congruence, and transparency. Referring to Kevin Lynch (1981) sub-dimensions of identity and structure are aspects of formal sense that can be used to identify public spaces. The sub-dimensions of congruence and transparency describe the relationship between the physical form of public space and non-physical values.

3.1 Structure

Jalan Menpor Palsigunung accommodates various overlapping activities such as trading, socializing, and transit that occur at any space and time whenever people are possible to do so. On-street parking and street vendors predominate the front of the shops, affecting the permeability of the shops for visitors. With proper pedestrian ways, visitors can easily walk on both sides of the street where vendors erect semi-permanent shelters. Although the street has inadequate lighting (as the lighting sources merely come from the existing buildings), the street's activities still need to be improved. The bustling spots on Jalan Menpor Palsigunung are not only triggered by commercial activities but also by mosque and educational facilities. In this case, the nodes defined by Kevin Lynch derived from the areas of Pasar Pal, the shop houses, mosque, elementary school, and street vendors occupied the temporary and semipermanent kiosks. Referring to Tiwari (2017), Jalan Menpor Palsigunung is a two-way street which could be classified as a multi-modal activity corridor. It is traversed by public transportation modes and private vehicles, dominated by motorcyclists and pedestrians who access using the shortcut at Pasar Pal (Figure 3.3). The shortcut connects Jalan Menpor Palsigunung with Jalan Akses UI at a walkable distance (less than 100 meters). Based on Figure 3.4, semi-permanent features on Jalan Menpor Palsigung are dominated kiosks selling food and beverage. PUBLIC AMENITIES



Figure 3.1. Mapping of Semi-Permanent Structures at Jalan Menpor Palsigunung (Author, 2022)



Figure 3.2. Semi-Permanent Structures (Author, 2022)



Figure 3.3. Shortcut in Pasar Pal Traditional Market (Author, 2022)

Street vendors with semi-permanent features on Jalan Menpor Palsigunung occupy the sidewalk and create temporary spaces that are directly connected to visitors without obstacles. The width of the sidewalk occupied by the street vendors on Jalan Menpor Palsigunung is 1.5 to 2 meters, with a height lower than a one-storey building (Figure 3.2). The semi-permanent features formed a human scale that pedestrians thoroughly captured. Figure 3.4 shows the visibility of semi-permanent facilities of which the structure is not permanently assembled nor merged with the surrounding buildings. Some vendors sell more than two types of goods, so this space increases the opportunity for interaction between traders and buyers. The visitors easily recognize the physical characteristics of the semi-permanent facility structure due to the distinctiveness of the form from other physical elements on Jalan Menpor Palsigunung.



Figure 3.4. Semi-Permanent Structures (Author, 2022)

3.2 Identity

Semi-permanent features tend to stand on both sides of the existing building wall, forming the free boundary (Figure 3.5) or becoming an 'extension' of shops to make the merchandise more accessible for visitors in front of the street (Figure 3.6). In some parts, the repetition of similar permanent features that cover the shelters, such as tarpaulin, generates a colourful image. The boundary between the semi-permanent facility and the street needs to be clarified due to the unavailability of proper pedestrian ways on Jalan Menpor Palsigunung (Figure 3.4, Figure 3.5). The semi-permanent features built specific characteristics and created an identity of Jalan Menpor Palsigunung. The identity is generated by the colours, shapes, and crowds; as a result, they lead to the perception that Jalan Menpor Palsigunung is a strip with a dominant commercial function. Unfortunately, during the observation, the author could not experience olfactory or sense of smell as many visitors should wear masks to comply with health protocols during the Covid-19 pandemic. In addition, when trying to observe the street by riding a motorcycle, the author experienced a different sense than observing on foot. Overall, street vendors hold an important role in creating an identity for Jalan Menpor Palsigunung. They are

potent to become actors for growing a sense of place (Lynch, 1981) and encourages placemaking (Tiwari, 2017).



Figure 3.5. Semi-Permanent at Jalan Menpor Palsigunung (Author, 2023)

3.3 Congruence

Public space can be used for the public interest. In contrast, semi-permanent facilities in pedestrian areas serve as meeting places for personal and public interests. For street vendors, this facility is a space to earn a living. For the visitors (mostly the inhabitants who live in the surrounding street), it is used to interact with people or the environment (Figure 3.4, Figure 3.7). Allegri (2017) observes that the phenomenon of temporary space for selling tends to be adjacent to shopping facilities, resulting in other forms of commercial facilities and the use of public space for selling. In the case of Jalan Menpor Palsigunung, the semi-permanent features share the same condition since the vendors tend to sell near Pasar Pal. Pasar Pal represents one of the leading commercial centres in Depok. Functionally, urban space on Jalan Menpor Palsigunung is predominantly commercial buildings, so that the existence of semi-permanent facilities for selling shows congruence. However, since there are no pedestrian ways, the vendors and the visitors utilize the area of the street allotted for vehicles. It makes vehicles should compete with pedestrians. Therefore, it shows a discrepancy in terms of the use of space.



Figure 3.6. Semi-Permanent Facility as an Extension of the Store (Author, 2023)

3.4 Transparency

Economic activities, specifically transactions in semi-permanent features, are visible through field observation. Economic activity also encourages social interaction even though they are just talking and not transacting. Both sellers and buyers verbally or non-verbally communicate mainly when the vendors are attracting buyers, bargaining process between vendors and buyers and transacting to close the trading. Other interactions occur among public space users, such as street vendors and motorcyclists (Figure 3.4), who stop to interact with the sellers on both sidewalks while still sit on their motorcycles. All actions show the transparency

of the activities that occurred there. Tiwari (2017) called the situation transparency of subdimension. The connection of the surrounding community to public space through activities in Jalan Menpor Palsigunung indicated semi-permanent features capable of creating a place.



Figure 3.7. Shared Space between Semi-Permanent Facility and Pedestrians (Author, 2022)

3.5 Overview of Sense at Jalan Menpor Palsigunung

This section addresses how space quality at Jalan Menpor Palsigunung can be learned from the observation of semi-permanent facilities on both sides of the street. The observation results are described based on the sub-dimensional sense aforementioned, which is structure, identity, congruence, and transparency.

Structure is the way each element in a place fits together so that people recognize one's orientation of a place. It can be drawn that Jalan Menpor Palsigunung accommodates 'overlapping' activities. The strip is dominated by commercial activities, enlivened by mosques and elementary schools. The scale of the semi-permanent facility is well-captured by pedestrians.

Identity is the extent to which a place can be identified and perceived through visible spatial forms and human senses. Semi-permanent facilities create a sense of place (Lynch, 1981) by repeating structural forms and the crowds they generate. In addition, there is no clear boundaries between semi-permanent facilities and pedestrian area.

Congruence is the compatibility of the spatial and the non-spatial structure which characterizes a place. Semi-permanent facility shows suitability and becomes an opportunity for traders. The discrepancy is evident because it occurs in a pedestrian area. On the other hand, some shop-owners seized the opportunity to expand their goods and services, therefore attracting more people on the street to visit the shops. It reflects upon how the interests of users that interacts with with semi-permanent facility at Jalan Menpor Palsigunung is diverse, therefore needs to be balanced in order to support the placemaking in the area.

Transparency is how the components can be perceived directly based on an environment's functions, activities, and social processes. Economic activity in Jalan Menpor Palsigunung encourages social interaction, which are established by users of public space, such as street vendors and motorcyclist in the semi-permanent facility. There is no additional information regarding the legal operation of the semi-permanent facilities at Jalan Menpor Palsigunung. Initially, Depok Regional Regulation of *Perda No. 16 of 2012* on Article 14 prohibited selling goods on roads, sidewalks, pedestrian bridges, railroads, and river banks. However, a more recent regulation, *Perda No. 2 of 2021* on Article 36 has introduced a control over the provision of small businesses and street vendors. This suggests that newer regulations allow the establishment of designated areas where these vendors, such as semi-permanent facilities, can legally carry out their business in Depok, but there are no details about the precise design areas.

4. Conclusion

This study attempts to identify activities in the temporary space based on the 'sense' dimension consisting of physical and non-physical aspects. The physical aspect includes a pedestrian area, whereas the non-physical aspects are trading activities in semi-permanent features in the sidewalk area. In the context of Jalan Menpor Palsigunung, the initial assumption in this research is that a semi-permanent facility characterized by crowds can revive the area. It generates through the long existence of Pasar Pal as commercial and centre of economic activities. The study strengthens the initial assumption that semi-permanent features for commercial can create opportunities for placemaking. It is derived from how these features give meaning to places through repetitive and colourful physical forms and trading activities that attract many people to participate.

The theory of good city form by Kevin Lynch is more than just a normative theory; it can also be used to identify informal areas related to the urban informality discussed by Chalana and Hou (2016) in Asian cities. This study contributes to understanding the empirical practice of the 'Good City Form' theory in the context of Depok, Indonesia. This initial research opens the possibility to be continued by exploring other dimensions of sense based on the Good City Form. Empirical study also could be conducted through direct interaction with the community.

Acknowledgments

This research was funded by Hibah PUTI Pasca Sarjana UI 2022 with the number: NKB 1472/UN2.RST/HKP.05.00/2022.

5. References

- Abusaada, H., & Elshater, A. (2021). Revealing Distinguishing Factors between Space and Place in Urban Design Literature. Journal Of Urban Design, 26(3), 319-340. Https://doi.org/10.1080/13574809.2020.1832887
- Allegri, A. (2017). Temporary Commercial Spaces: Celebrating the 'Right to the City'. In Architectural Research Addressing Societal Challenges (Pp. 62-68). CRC Press. doi: 10.1201/9781315226255-11
- Chalana, M., & Hou, J. (Eds.). (2016). Messy urbanism: Understanding the "other" cities of Asia. Hong Kong University Press.
- Dovey, K. (2016). Urban Design Thinking: A Conceptual Toolkit. Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Fontana-Giusti, G. K. (2007). Urban Strolling as The Measure of Quality. Arq: Architectural Research Quarterly, 11(3-4), 255-264.
- Froome-Lewis, O. (2014). Lea Valley Drift: Paths, Objects and The Creation of Urban Narratives. Arq: Architectural Research Quarterly, 18(4), 377-388.
- Gehl, J. (2010). Cities for people. Island press.
- Lynch, K. (1981). A Theory of Good City Form. MIT Press.
- Madanipour, A. (2018). Temporary Use of Space: Urban Processes Between Flexibility, Opportunity and Precarity. Urban Studies, 55(5), 1093-1110. DOI: 10.1177/0042098017705546
- Nishikawa, H., Ellisa, E., & Kinoshita, I. (2019, March). Accessibility in Kelapa Dua Depok. In IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science (Vol. 248, No. 1, p. 012082). IOP Publishing.
- Oliveira, V. (2016). Urban Morphology: An Introduction to The Study of The Physical Form of Cities.
- Tiwari, R. (2017). Connecting Places, Connecting People: A Paradigm for Urban Living in The Twenty-First Century. Routledge.

United Nation. (2017). New Urban Agenda.

Wasnadi, H. F., & Ellisa, E. (2019). Informality and Rapid Urban Transformation: Case Study of Kelapa Dua, Depok. In IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science (Vol. 248, No. 1, p. 012043). IOP Publishing.